Enablers of Hubs & Coalitions for Education Reform
- Lessons from India & Brazil

RISE Annual Conference

Kat Pattillo

September 22, 2023
Looking For Innovation In Education? Go To Kenya.

Some of the world's leading work on education is happening in Nairobi. What makes a city an innovation hub?
ATHENS
500-300 BC
Socrates / Agora
Plato’s Academy
Aristotle’s Lyceum
>> democracy

LONDON
1700’s
Coffeehouses
>> enlightenment

PARIS
1940’s
Cafes, artists, writers
>> existentialism / art

SILICON VALLEY
1970’s/80’s
Homebrew Computer Club
Stanford
>> PC / internet
RESEARCH QUESTIONS

I. Why do certain places at certain times become hubs for education reforms and innovation?

II. When coalitions for education reform do emerge, what forms can they take?
METHODS

- MPhil thesis at University of Oxford in Comparative Politics (2020-2022)
- **Shadow cases analysis**
  - Survey of 106 countries to identify 20 hubs
  - Consultations with 5 experts
  - My experience of 10 years interviewing/training/advising leaders in the sector (South Africa, Kenya, etc)
  - Desk research
- **2 qualitative case studies**
  - 23 semi-structured interviews
  - 2 weeks in São Paulo + Delhi virtual
  - Process tracing
  - Document analysis
- Builds on literature in: political sociology, social movement theory, collective action, innovation diffusion

* Turning into book on how to transform ed systems (3 months in Brazil, 1.5 months in India)
106 Countries Survey

- **Latin America:**
  - Mexico to Chile
- **Africa:**
  - North & Sub-Saharan
- **South Asia:**
  - Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan, Sri Lanka
- **Southeast Asia:**
  - Brunei, Myanmar, Cambodia, Timor-Leste, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, Vietnam

Looking for high density in 3 areas:

- **Innovations (nonprofits/companies)**
- **Political Will & Government Reforms**
- **Coalitions**
Most places in the Global South are not hubs.

### 5. Rare Coalitions or Political Will

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Case</th>
<th>Place Structure</th>
<th>People Agency</th>
<th>Coalition Process</th>
<th>Political Will Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>War &amp; Conflict</strong></td>
<td>Kabul, Khartoum, Kinshasa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Crisis</strong></td>
<td>Caracas, Buenos Aires</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Humanitarian &amp; Political Crisis</strong></td>
<td>Cairo, Port-au-Prince</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Predominantly Rural</strong></td>
<td>Bamako, Managua, Thimpu</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*These are examples (not comprehensive list of cases).*
Classified 4 categories with at least 20 hubs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Case</th>
<th>Place Structure</th>
<th>People Agency</th>
<th>Coalition Process</th>
<th>Political Will Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Coalitions With Political Will</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delhi, São Paulo</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nairobi, Lahore</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johannesburg/Cape Town</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Political Will in Difficult Environments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addis Ababa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freetown, Monrovia, Kigali</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quito</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Political Will in Easier Environments</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lima, Santiago, Hanoi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accra</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico City/Puebla State, Lagos/Edo State</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Non-state Actors in Low Political Will</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kampala, Jakarta, Dhaka, Bogotá/Medellín</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# CASE SELECTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movimento pela Base</th>
<th>Aam Aadmi Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>São Paulo, Brazil</td>
<td>Delhi, India</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PHILANTHROPY-LED**

- (Lemann Foundation)
- *Coalition to Political Will*

- National policy rolled out across states/municipalities
- Mostly govt schools
- Movement with 65+ members

**POLITICAL PARTY-LED**

- (Support of NGO’s/funders)
- *Political Will to Coalition*

- State policy (union territory) + after Delhi, Punjab state
- ~\( \frac{1}{3} \) private schools
- State-led reform group

---

**Differences**

**Similarities**

- Based in megacities - 5th largest
- World’s largest countries - 7th
- Democracies with rising populist/far-right politicians

- 2nd largest
- 1st
● New political party with political will for education --> created opportunity
● Launched in 2012
● Won Delhi Municipal Assembly in 2015
● Model schools, School Management Committees, an entrepreneurship curriculum, skills-based placement, infrastructure, teacher training, and more
● ~1.84 million students
● (For more on the rollout of one of the policies, read the RISE book by Yamini Aiyar and others.)
Leave God out of the culture wars
Tom Friedman

Russia says its diamonds are ethical, not 'bloody'
Western countries move to label gems as tainted by the war in Ukraine

‘Our children are worth it’
New Delhi

Over half of public schools in the capital of India have students who are struggling to read.
● Funder created opportunity --> created political will
● Started by Lemann Foundation in 2012 (LF started 2002)
● 65+ leaders from government, nonprofits, academia
● National learning standards (similar to US Common Core)
● ~40 million students
● (For more, read the Lemann Foundation story of MPB.)
EDUCAÇÃO NÃO SE VENDE! 
CONTRA A REFORMA DO ENSINO MÉDIO!
Why are some places hubs and not others?

Identified at least **13 factors** -

**Some beyond any individual’s control (more structural/forces):**
- Cities/Urbanization & Density
- Economic Growth
- Norms & Practices
- Events & Chance

**BUT many within our realm of influence:**
- Talent Pipelines
- Seed an Ecosystem of Organizations
- Data --> Political Will
- Spread Activist Skills / Repertoires
- Exposure to Progressive Education
- Cross-Border Sharing
- Trips --> Trust & Solidarity
- Intentional Orchestrator
- Co-Creation in Design
Cities / Urbanization

---> dense networks for innovation

Beissinger 2022:
urbanization/networks --> revolutions

Zhao 1998 & Van Dyke 1998:
Density & physical spaces enable activist networks

Cities are hubs for trade / idea flow
Economic Growth

--> more money for philanthropy

“Most of my individual donors...they are all somehow connected to the 3G group.”

- Erica Butow, Ensina Brasil
HARDER TO INFLUENCE

Norms / Practices

--> for collective action (*mutirão, seva, samaj*)
& history of strong social movements (*MST*)

Chaisty et al 2018: Brazil democracy: coalitional presidentialism
HARDER TO INFLUENCE

Events & Chance

--> elections, impeachments, appointments, arrests

(Maria Castro, Manish Sisodia)

Tarrow 1994: Role of timing, political opportunities, windows in history

The New York Times
Feb. 27, 2023

Top Indian Opposition Leader Arrested on Corruption Charges

The detention follows a bitter fight between India's B.J.P. governing party and a regional competitor with national ambitions.
Politics determines when windows open or close.

**INDIA**

- Rise of AAP
- BJP/central government crackdown on dissidents, journalists, opposition parties
- Manish Sisodia arrest (read more about his case [here](#))
- High cost to criticizing central government

**BRAZIL**

- Dilma Roussef impeachment
- Michel Temer appointment
- Bolsonaro election
- Lula election
“Being a part of the Lemann network really helps for people starting to be entrepreneurs, because now they have access to people like me who are now [in] my fifth company.”

- Leticia Lyle, Camino Education

McAdam 1982:
Leaders & organizers
Only THREE leaders can be a catalyst.

(But leaders are not enough...)

Arvind Kejriwal
Manish Sisodia
Atishi

Jorge Paulo Lemann
Denis Mizne
Alice Ribeiro
Seed an Ecosystem of Organizations

social entrepreneurs, activists, funders

Read more on these foundations here.
Data --> Political Will

ASER > Sisodia
Spread Activist Skills

Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung Foundation
spread repertoires
Exposure to Progressive Education

Atishi > Rishi Valley School
Cross-Border Sharing

AAP > Finland, Singapore, LF > US, Australia

The Washington Post

How Bill Gates pulled off the swift Common Core revolution

By Lindsay Lavid

June 7, 2014 at 7:25 p.m. EDT
Trips --> Trust & Solidarity

LF trip to Yale, AAP trip to rural village

Tarrow 2012:
Trust --> social movements

Diani 1992:
Role of “collective identities”
Power of Orchestrator

McAdam 1982:
Institutions --> civil rights movement
Infrastructure / organized campaign

Tarrow 1994:
“Interpersonal networks”
Co-Creation In Design

MPB state/city forums, Sisodia home dinners
Why do coalitions emerge?

At least two pathways:

**PLACE** + **PEOPLE** + **PROCESS**

**Cities & Density**  
**Economic Growth**  
**Talent Pipelines**  
**Embedded Practices**  

**Political Entrepreneurs & Activists**  
**Social Entrepreneurs**  
**Funders**

**Strike Scenario**

1. **Motivated Initiators**
   - Commit to Cause

2. **Orchestrator Creates**
   - Container to Mobilize

3. **Co-Design & Feedback**
   - to Grow Allies

4. **Trust & Solidarity**
   - Through Obstacles

5. **Luck With Preparation & Networks**

**Slow-Build Scenario**
Coalitions can happen fast. And there is a process.

*Political Will Before Coalition*
THE STRIKE SCENARIO

1. Motivated Initiators Commit to Cause

1A. Commit to start a new party

1B. Commit to education in a certain place as a priority issue

1C. Win the power and mandate to do it

“I see for the first time a political party making education an agenda...It’s not ever been seen as a political agenda for votes.”

- Shaveta Sharma-Kukreja, Central Square Foundation
2. Orchestrator Creates Container to Mobilize

2A. Technocratic skills for execution
2B. Availability of implementation experts
2C. Support from an active funder
2D. Orchestrator for skilled facilitation of coalition process
2E. Learning from non-Delhi models

NGO’s
CMI Fellows
Pro Bono Advisors
CSF Project Management Unit
Education Alliance
THE STRIKE SCENARIO

3. Co-Design & Feedback to Grow Allies

3A. Process of co-design
3B. Oversight and quality control of implementation
3C. Pressure to deliver visible results
3D. Partners willing to let politicians take the credit

“One of the key factors behind the successful partnership has been the fact that the stakeholders from the government side are involved in the designing of the program, from day one. So it was never a store developed and delivered model. It was always co-designed and developed and co-deliver. So there was ownership right from the beginning.”

- Swaha Sahoo, STIR
THE STRIKE SCENARIO

4. Trust & Solidarity Through Obstacles

4A. Incentives to use coalition approach
4B. Informal relationship-building between partners
4C. Resistance to change from the system
4D. Belief that the system could change

“There was a lot of pushback on” many of the “agendas that Minister [Sisodia] also wanted to bring on the ground...In bureaucracy, you’ll find the people in India look for precedents, and in absence of precedents...there is a lot of delay.”

- Sambhrant Srivastava, former CSF seconded to Delhi govt
5. Luck With Preparation & Networks

5A. Personal values

5B. Timing & choices

5C. Interactions

2020-11 Anti-corruption protests
2014 Modi elected PM
2015 Landslide AAP win
Central crackdown on opposition, journalists
2023 Sisodia arrest >> Atishi
Or coalitions can happen gradually. And there is a process.

**Coalition Before Political Will**

For more, read my [toolkit on coalition-building](#) based on MPB.
1. **Motivated Initiators Commit to Cause**

1A. A highly committed funder with an advocacy mindset

1B. Activist skills

1C. Benchmarking against other countries to choose a goal

1D. Clear outcomes with adaptive funding

“This is what changed when Denis came in, this idea of if we want to get to scale, we are going to do advocacy to influence the public sector.”

- Camila Pareira, Lemann Foundation

“These problems cannot be solved in a four-year term.”

- Denis Mizne, Lemann Foundation

Mizne: Sou da Paz
Ribeiro: Sou da Paz & Todos
THE SLOW-BUILD SCENARIO

2. Orchestrator Creates Container to Mobilize

2A. Skills to facilitate and design a coalition process

2B. Participant selection

2C. Norms for a space of trust

2013 - 28 leaders to Yale for 3 days
Politicians, federal agencies, states,
NGO’s, funders, academics

2014 - Ribeiro hired
~60 members + ~30 allies

“In the beginning, we had people who would never sit together in the same table.”

- Julia Ishikawa, Lemann Foundation
3. Co-Design & Feedback to Grow Allies

3A. Co-creation to increase buy-in

3B. 1-1 relationship-building

3C. Feedback loops and research production - inside Brazil

3D. Technical knowledge through feedback loops and research - outside Brazil

“The reason why the national learning standards have been embraced by the networks of education [is] because they built it...They know why things are there. So it might not be perfect. If we would just do it like they did with the Common Core, three people in a room writing it, maybe we would get a much better technical document. But it would be inside a drawer.”

- Alice Ribeiro, Movimento pela Base

Ribeiro 1-1’s & email updates
Group meetings - updates, train, co-create
2 Yale trips
30 research outputs
27 state forums
26 public forums
Online feedback platform - 300,000 comments
Opinion polls
Online Observatory tracker of policy rollout
THE SLOW-BUILD SCENARIO

4. Trust & Solidarity Through Obstacles

4A. Consensus despite diverse views

4B. Collaborating towards a shared goal

4C. Momentum to gain traction

“For this policy that was so fragile at the beginning, so much resistance, there was a chance that it was going down... Those associations kept the work going on during this process until the new government would take charge.”

- Julia Ishikawa, Lemann Foundation

“Why the movement was important was to create this kind of space, where people that were very influential in the public debate had the opportunity to talk to the ones that were in charge of really writing the standards... to manifest their worries and concerns. I think that lowered the tension in the public debate.”

- Camila Pereira, Lemann Foundation
5. Luck With Preparation & Networks

5A. Personal values

5B. Timing & choices

5C. Interactions

Maria Helena Guimarães de Castro: State Secretary São Paulo
2nd at Ministry of Ed under Temer
Co-wrote critical op-ed
Brazil social movements >

Todos pela Educação >

MPB >

BCLN, CSN, Arcos, IF group

India social movements >

AAP in Delhi >

AAP in Punjab >

Influencing other parties

Education Alliance was invited to work with leaders in Tamil Nadu, and “they are certainly inviting us because they’re seeing that politically, education can be a road to electoral success.”

- Amitav Virmani, Education Alliance
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cities to Nearby States</th>
<th>Puebla &gt; 2.5 hours to Mexico City</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Benin City &gt; 4 hours from Lagos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Haryana &gt; Delhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twin Cities</td>
<td>Bogotá &gt; 1 hour from Medellín</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Johannesburg &gt; 2 hours from Cape Town</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Politicians can make a difference - but this takes different forms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catalytic Federal in Small Countries</td>
<td>Sirleaf/Werner, Bio/Sengeh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalytic Federal in Small Centralized</td>
<td>Kagame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State-Led in Large Decentralized</td>
<td>Obaseki/Edo, Sharif/Punjab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayors &amp; State/Province Governors</td>
<td>Gomes/Sobral</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions?

kat@edwell.io

Lessons from bright spots, tools, jobs, funding, courses:

LinkedIn: Kat Pattillo

Newsletter: edwell.substack.com