What have we learned about how to support teaching?
A reflection on Choose and Curate toward Commitment to Capable and Committed teachers (5Cs)

Yue-Yi Hwa
RISE Programme / University of Oxford
15 November 2022
Our vision of the future: empowered, highly respected, strongly performance-normed, contextually embedded teaching professions that cultivate student learning …
... but in many developing countries, there is a large gap between this vision and teachers’ day-to-day realities
In many developing countries, education systems fail to cultivate learning for many children, even those in school.

### 10-year-olds in all low- and middle-income countries

- **Enrolled in school and able to read and understand a simple text, 47.3%**
- **Enrolled in school but unable to read and understand a simple text, 44.0%**
- **Out of school, 8.7%**

(Source: World Bank, Learning Poverty (2015))

### 15-year-olds in 7 middle-income countries

- **Enrolled in grade 7 or above, above PISA level 2, 9.1%**
- **Enrolled in grade 7 or above, below PISA level 2, 33.5%**
- **Out of school or enrolled below grade 7, 57.4%**

(Source: PISA-D (Cambodia, Ecuador, Guatemala, Honduras, Paraguay, Senegal, Zambia, 2014–2016))

### Additional Sources

This is partly because education systems are failing to cultivate and support capable and committed teachers.

In SACMEQ 2007, only 21% of Grade 6 teachers in South Africa demonstrated mastery of the maths content they were supposed to be teaching.

Across the 8 African countries surveyed in the SDI, an average of 40% of randomly selected teachers were absent from the classroom during an unannounced visit.

Initially, I didn’t know whether I agreed with Lant’s views on how to move from discouraging realities to inspiring vision ...
A proposal for teacher career structures in India (Pritchett & Pande, 2006)

Phases of Teacher Professionalization

- **Apprentice (Shiksha Karmi)**
  - Initial hiring into a pool of available teachers by ZP on technical criteria (with a GP recommendation)
  - Assignment (and hence pay) to school position from pool depends on GP/VEC/SMC
  - Assignment is renewable and not guaranteed.

- **Associate (Adhyapak)**
  - Greater permanence granted at end apprentice period (7 years?) based on comprehensive evaluation
    - **Technical Criteria**: training, input indicators, teacher tests (district)
  - **Bottoms Up Criteria**: Performance review and recommendation by GP/SMC, Peer Contribution

- **Master (Maha-Adhyapak)**
  - Few promoted to 'Maha-Adhyapaks' based on consistently exceptional performance evaluation ratings

Typical civil service approach: commitment from day 1
An example of a 5Cs approach: choose and curate toward commitment …
… but when I thought more about it, I found three reasons why “curation” should be a key principle for the pre-service and novice phases of the teaching profession.
(1) Pre-service selection mechanisms don’t usually give education employers enough information about who will succeed in the classroom.

A study of a pre-service teacher education programme in Indonesia found that standardised indicators could not predict teachers’ contributions to students’ learning.

“… we find no evidence for a correlation between the selection criteria* [for the teacher education programme] and student learning outcomes [two years after their teachers graduated].

—Yusrina, et al. (2022), p. 2

*Selection criteria comprised: undergraduate GPA; admissions tests (aptitude, English, pedagogical knowledge); and an interview.

See also Bau & Das (2020) on Pakistan; Cruz-Aguayo, Ibarrarán, & Schady (2017) on Ecuador; and Hanushek & Rivkin (2006) on the US.
(2) Pre-service training doesn’t usually give teachers themselves enough information about whether they will thrive in the profession long-term.
(2) Pre-service training doesn’t usually give teachers themselves enough information about whether they will thrive in the profession long-term.
Early-career occupational turnover is normal in comparable professions—and can have beneficial “match effects” for both employers and employees.

The findings … provide no support for the hypothesis that patterns of teacher turnover have a detrimental effect on the quality of public school teaching staffs. In fact, the results indicate that there is selective attrition from one urban public school system of the less productive elementary school teachers. All of the selective attrition that does occur takes place during the first years on the job, a pattern consistent with the view that important new information about the quality of the job match is generated during the initial years on the job …

—Murnane (1984), p. 517

The 5Cs:
Choose and curate toward commitment to capable and committed teachers
One level of systems thinking: the interaction between different design elements and phases of teacher careers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Design elements of teaching careers</th>
<th>Pre-service &lt;0 years</th>
<th>Novice 0–5 years</th>
<th>Experienced 5–25 years</th>
<th>Veteran &gt;25 years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Delegation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who does what where?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How well are they doing it?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What would help them to do it better?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does compensation attract, retain, and motivate quality teaching?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How should ‘good teachers’ act?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Adapted from the RISE framework. See Pritchett (2015), [https://doi.org/10.35489/BSG-RISE-WP_2015/005](https://doi.org/10.35489/BSG-RISE-WP_2015/005)
Effective organisations are effective from the inside out—from their core purpose + technical practices advancing the purpose.
Another salient level of systems thinking: the interaction between different sources of teacher motivation

- **Finances**: Money
- **Material Circumstances**: Stuff that money can buy
- **Personal Satisfaction**: Goal fulfilment & identification with a larger cause
- **Social Validation**: Respect & appreciation
Why **choose and curate**? Because a commitment-only approach misses key opportunities to build professional standards

> A probationary period on entry to teaching should be recognized both by teachers and by employers as the opportunity for the **encouragement and helpful initiation of the entrant** and for the **establishment and maintenance of proper professional standards** as well as the **teacher’s own development of his practical teaching proficiency**. … the conditions for its satisfactory completion should be strictly related to professional competence …

*ILO/UNESCO (1966), Recommendation Concerning the Status of Teachers, para. 39*
Why **choose and curate**? Because a commitment-only approach misses key opportunities to build professional standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources of teacher motivation</th>
<th>Choose and curate toward commitment to C and C</th>
<th>Commitment only (typical civil service)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finances</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material Circumstances</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Satisfaction</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Validation</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A probationary period on entry to teaching should be recognized both by teachers and by employers as the opportunity for the **encouragement and helpful initiation of the entrant** and for the **establishment and maintenance of proper professional standards** as well as the **teacher’s own development of his practical teaching proficiency**. … the conditions for its satisfactory completion should be strictly related to professional competence …

*ILO/UNESCO (1966), Recommendation Concerning the Status of Teachers, para. 39*
The 5Cs are a set of principles—which can (and should!) be implemented differently in different contexts

We can identify elements of teacher careers that look very different on the surface, but similarly reflect aspects of choose-and-curate-toward-commitment-to-capable-and-committed teachers:

**Finland**
- **Choose**: intensive, two-stage screening for entry to pre-service training

**Singapore**
- **Curate**: ‘compulsory untrained teaching stint’ prior to pre-service training

**Brazil**
- **Committed**: municipal authority to tailor some elements of teacher careers to local prioritise (e.g., Sobral)

**Peru**
- **Capable**: national-level test of teacher knowledge and accreditation of pre-service training

LESS CENTRALISED (starfish)

MORE CENTRALISED (spider)
Education authorities and organisations should apply the 5Cs ...

Choose and Curate toward Commitment to Capable and Committed teachers

... in order to create Conditions in which teachers are empowered, highly respected professionals ...

... in education systems that are thoroughly Coherent for the purpose of student learning ...

... and are fully embedded within their respective Contexts.
The 5Cs of teacher career reform:

Choose and Curate toward Commitment to Capable and Committed teachers

To access the full primer, visit riseprogramme.org/research and search for ‘5Cs’
Stay in touch:

riseprogramme.org

yue-yi.hwa@bsg.ox.ac.uk

@riseprogramme

@riseprogramme

RISE Programme